

1. BCS ground state

Show that $\tilde{\gamma}_{\mathbf{k}\sigma}|\psi_0\rangle = 0$ for the BCS ground state $|\psi_0\rangle$, which means that $|\psi_0\rangle$ is the vacuum state for excitations. Consider at least the case $\sigma = \uparrow$.

(Hint: It is useful to define $c_{\mathbf{k}} = u_{\mathbf{k}} + v_{\mathbf{k}}a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger$ and to show that $[c_{\mathbf{k}}, c_{\mathbf{k}'}] = 0$.)

Solution:

Some preliminaries first. These should be useful also elsewhere. The BCS ground state is

$$|\psi_0\rangle = \prod_{\mathbf{k}} (u_{\mathbf{k}} + v_{\mathbf{k}}a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger) |vac\rangle$$

where $|vac\rangle$ is the vacuum state: $a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}|vac\rangle = 0$. Defining $c_{\mathbf{k}} = u_{\mathbf{k}} + v_{\mathbf{k}}a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger$, we may write

$$|\psi_0\rangle = \prod_{\mathbf{k}} c_{\mathbf{k}} |vac\rangle$$

Is the order of $c_{\mathbf{k}}$ s in the product relevant, or can we freely commute them? Let's see. For $\mathbf{k} \neq \mathbf{l}$ we find

$$\begin{aligned} c_{\mathbf{k}}c_{\mathbf{l}} &= (u_{\mathbf{k}} + v_{\mathbf{k}}a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger)(u_{\mathbf{l}} + v_{\mathbf{l}}a_{\mathbf{l}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{l}\downarrow}^\dagger) \\ &= u_{\mathbf{k}}u_{\mathbf{l}} + u_{\mathbf{k}}v_{\mathbf{l}}a_{\mathbf{l}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{l}\downarrow}^\dagger + u_{\mathbf{l}}v_{\mathbf{k}}a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger + v_{\mathbf{k}}v_{\mathbf{l}}a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger a_{\mathbf{l}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{l}\downarrow}^\dagger \\ &= u_{\mathbf{l}}u_{\mathbf{k}} + u_{\mathbf{l}}v_{\mathbf{k}}a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger + u_{\mathbf{k}}v_{\mathbf{l}}a_{\mathbf{l}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{l}\downarrow}^\dagger + v_{\mathbf{l}}v_{\mathbf{k}}a_{\mathbf{l}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{l}\downarrow}^\dagger a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger \\ &= c_{\mathbf{l}}c_{\mathbf{k}} \end{aligned}$$

Thus the operators commute. (Getting to the second to last line requires anticommuting operators in the four-operator term 4 times ($a_i^\dagger a_j^\dagger = -a_j^\dagger a_i^\dagger$), which thus keeps the sign intact.)

Now to the problem itself. Using the above commutation result, we can isolate from the BCS ground state an arbitrary $c_{\mathbf{k}} = u_{\mathbf{k}} + v_{\mathbf{k}}a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger$ factor and bring it to the front of the product. Thus we need to calculate for example

$$\gamma_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}|\psi_0\rangle = \gamma_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}c_{\mathbf{k}} \prod_{\mathbf{l} \neq \mathbf{k}} c_{\mathbf{l}} |vac\rangle$$

where $\gamma_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow} = u_k a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow} - v_k a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger$. Now an intermediate result.

$$\begin{aligned}
\gamma_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow} c_{\mathbf{k}} &= (u_k a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow} - v_k a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger)(u_k + v_k a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger) \\
&= u_k^2 a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow} + u_k v_k a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow} a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger - u_k v_k a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger - v_k^2 a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger \\
&= u_k^2 a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow} + u_k v_k a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger - u_k v_k a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow} a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger - u_k v_k a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger + v_k^2 a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger \\
&= u_k^2 a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow} + u_k v_k a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow} = u_k c_{\mathbf{k}} a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}
\end{aligned}$$

Since there is no $c_{\mathbf{k}}$ -factor in the product $\prod_{\mathbf{l} \neq \mathbf{k}} c_{\mathbf{l}}$ (and $[a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}, c_{-\mathbf{k}}] = 0$, as you may check), we may move the $a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}$ operator all the way through:

$$\gamma_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow} |\psi_0\rangle = \gamma_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow} c_{\mathbf{k}} \prod_{\mathbf{l} \neq \mathbf{k}} c_{\mathbf{l}} |vac\rangle = u_k c_{\mathbf{k}} a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow} \prod_{\mathbf{l} \neq \mathbf{k}} c_{\mathbf{l}} |vac\rangle = u_k c_{\mathbf{k}} \prod_{\mathbf{l} \neq \mathbf{k}} c_{\mathbf{l}} a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow} |vac\rangle = 0$$

A similar proof can be given for $\gamma_{\mathbf{k}\downarrow} |\psi_0\rangle = 0$. One can for example isolate $c_{-\mathbf{k}}$ in front of the product and take it on from there.

Note: One can in fact construct the state $|\psi_0\rangle$ from the requirement that $\gamma_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow} |\psi_0\rangle = 0$. This property leads directly to the guess that $|\psi_0\rangle \propto \prod_{\mathbf{k}, \sigma} \gamma_{\mathbf{k}, \sigma} |vac\rangle$ where $a_{\mathbf{k}, \sigma} |vac\rangle = 0$. One may first show that $\gamma_{\mathbf{k}, \uparrow} \gamma_{-\mathbf{k}, \downarrow} |vac\rangle = v_k (u_k + v_k a_{\mathbf{k}, \uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}, \downarrow}^\dagger) |vac\rangle$ and then argue that $|\psi_0\rangle \propto \prod_{\mathbf{k}} (\gamma_{\mathbf{k}, \uparrow} \gamma_{-\mathbf{k}, \downarrow}) |vac\rangle \propto \prod_{\mathbf{k}} (u_k + v_k a_{\mathbf{k}, \uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}, \downarrow}^\dagger) |vac\rangle$. This is left as an additional exercise.

2. Normalization of the BCS ground state

Assuming that $\langle vac | vac \rangle = 1$, show that the BCS ground state $|\psi_0\rangle$ is normalized as $\langle \psi_0 | \psi_0 \rangle = 1$.

Solution:

Define (once more) the operators $c_{\mathbf{k}} = u_k + v_k a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger$, which satisfy $[c_{\mathbf{k}}, c_{\mathbf{l}}] = 0$. Then

$$\langle \psi_0 | \psi_0 \rangle = \langle vac | \prod_{\mathbf{k}} c_{\mathbf{k}}^\dagger \prod_{\mathbf{l}} c_{\mathbf{l}} |vac\rangle$$

Let us order the products as follows

$$\langle \psi_0 | \psi_0 \rangle = \langle vac | \prod_{\mathbf{m} \neq \mathbf{k}} c_{\mathbf{m}}^\dagger c_{\mathbf{k}}^\dagger c_{\mathbf{k}} \prod_{\mathbf{l} \neq \mathbf{k}} c_{\mathbf{l}} |vac\rangle$$

Here

$$\begin{aligned}
c_{\mathbf{k}}^\dagger c_{\mathbf{k}} &= (u_k^* + v_k^* a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow} a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}) (u_k + v_k a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger) \\
&= |u_k|^2 + u_k^* v_k a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger + v_k^* u_k a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow} a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow} + |v_k|^2 a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow} a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow} a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger \\
&= |u_k|^2 + |v_k|^2 a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow} a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger - |v_k|^2 a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow} a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow} a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger + u_k^* v_k a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger + v_k^* u_k a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow} a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow} \\
&= 1 - |v_k|^2 a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow} + |v_k|^2 a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow} a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow} + u_k^* v_k a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger + v_k^* u_k a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow} a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}
\end{aligned}$$

where the anticommutation rules and $|u_k|^2 + |v_k|^2 = 1$ were used. The last four terms clearly all produce zeroes in $\langle \psi_0 | \psi_0 \rangle$. What thus remains is simply

$$\langle \psi_0 | \psi_0 \rangle = \langle vac | \prod_{\mathbf{m} \neq \mathbf{k}} c_{\mathbf{m}}^\dagger \prod_{\mathbf{l} \neq \mathbf{k}} c_{\mathbf{l}} | vac \rangle = \dots = \langle vac | vac \rangle = 1$$

The dots mean that we can repeat the above procedure by isolating some other $c_{\mathbf{m}}^\dagger c_{\mathbf{m}}$ with $\mathbf{m} \neq \mathbf{k}$ in the center of the sandwich. When this is done for all wave vectors, all that remains is $\langle vac | vac \rangle$, which equals 1 by assumption.

3. Excitations of BCS state

Let $|\psi_0\rangle$ be the BCS ground state. Show that the excited states $\tilde{\gamma}_{\mathbf{k}\sigma}^\dagger |\psi_0\rangle$ are of the form where the single-particle state $\mathbf{k}\sigma$ (to which particles are created by $\tilde{a}_{\mathbf{k}\sigma}^\dagger$) is populated and $-\mathbf{k} - \sigma$ is empty. You can limit to the case $\sigma = \uparrow$.

Solution:

Define (again) the operators $c_{\mathbf{k}} = u_k + v_k a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger$, which satisfy $[c_{\mathbf{k}}, c_{\mathbf{l}}] = 0$. Now first

$$\tilde{\gamma}_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger |\psi_0\rangle = \gamma_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger c_{\mathbf{k}} \prod_{\mathbf{l} \neq \mathbf{k}} c_{\mathbf{l}} | vac \rangle$$

Then by using the anticommutation relations

$$\begin{aligned} \gamma_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger c_{\mathbf{k}} &= (u_k^* a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger - v_k^* a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}) (u_k + v_k a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger) \\ &= |u_k|^2 a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger + u_k^* v_k a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger - v_k^* u_k a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow} - |v_k|^2 a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow} a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger \\ &= |u_k|^2 a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger - v_k^* u_k a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow} + |v_k|^2 a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow} a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger \\ &= |u_k|^2 a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger - v_k^* u_k a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow} + |v_k|^2 a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger - |v_k|^2 a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow} \\ &= a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger - v_k^* c_{\mathbf{k}} a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow} \end{aligned}$$

Note that we used $|u_k|^2 + |v_k|^2 = 1$. Now back to what we were doing:

$$\begin{aligned} \tilde{\gamma}_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger |\psi_0\rangle &= \gamma_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger c_{\mathbf{k}} \prod_{\mathbf{l} \neq \mathbf{k}} c_{\mathbf{l}} | vac \rangle = a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger \prod_{\mathbf{l} \neq \mathbf{k}} c_{\mathbf{l}} | vac \rangle - v_k^* c_{\mathbf{k}} a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow} \prod_{\mathbf{l} \neq \mathbf{k}} c_{\mathbf{l}} | vac \rangle \\ &= a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger \prod_{\mathbf{l} \neq \mathbf{k}} c_{\mathbf{l}} | vac \rangle - v_k^* \prod_{\mathbf{l}} c_{\mathbf{l}} a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow} | vac \rangle = a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^\dagger \prod_{\mathbf{l} \neq \mathbf{k}} c_{\mathbf{l}} | vac \rangle \end{aligned}$$

In this state clearly the level $-\mathbf{k} \downarrow$ is empty, and $\mathbf{k} \uparrow$ is filled. A similar proof can be repeated for $\tilde{\gamma}_{\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^\dagger |\psi_0\rangle$.

4. Energy functional

Show that for the energy functional ($u_k^2 = 1 - v_k^2$, $\xi_k = \hbar^2 k^2 / 2m - \mu$)

$$\begin{aligned} \Omega(T, V, \mu, v_k, \Delta) &= 2 \sum_{\mathbf{k}} (\xi_k v_k^2 - \Delta u_k v_k) + \frac{L^3}{g} \Delta^2 \\ &\quad - 2k_B T \sum_{\mathbf{k}} \ln(1 + e^{-\sqrt{\xi_k^2 + \Delta^2} / k_B T}), \end{aligned}$$

the relations

$$\frac{\partial \Omega}{\partial v_k} = 0, \quad \frac{\partial \Omega}{\partial \Delta} = 0,$$

are equivalent with the conditions (152) and (158) of the lecture notes.

Solution:

The energy functional is

$$\begin{aligned} \Omega(T, V, \mu, v_k, \Delta) = & 2 \sum_{\mathbf{k}} (\xi_k v_k^2 - \Delta u_k v_k) + \frac{L^3}{g} \Delta^2 \\ & - 2k_B T \sum_{\mathbf{k}} \ln(1 + e^{-\sqrt{\xi_k^2 + \Delta^2}/k_B T}), \end{aligned}$$

First,

$$\frac{\partial \Omega}{\partial v_k} = 2(2\xi_k v_k - \Delta u_k - \Delta v_k \frac{\partial u_k}{\partial v_k})$$

Here we note that $u_k = \sqrt{1 - v_k^2}$ and thus

$$\frac{\partial u_k}{\partial v_k} = -\frac{2v_k}{2\sqrt{1 - v_k^2}} = -\frac{v_k}{u_k}$$

So

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial \Omega}{\partial v_k} &= 0 \\ 2\xi_k v_k - \Delta u_k + \Delta v_k^2/u_k &= 0 \\ 2\xi_k u_k v_k - \Delta u_k^2 + \Delta v_k^2 &= 0 \end{aligned}$$

This is equal to (152). (Note that, for notational simplicity, we've only considered Ω to be a function of a single v_k , but of course there is one for each \mathbf{k} .)

Second,

$$\frac{\partial \Omega}{\partial \Delta} = -2 \sum_{\mathbf{k}} u_k v_k + 2 \frac{L^3}{g} \Delta - 2k_B T \sum_{\mathbf{k}} \frac{e^{-E_k/k_B T}}{1 + e^{-E_k/k_B T}} \left(-\frac{1}{k_B T}\right) \frac{\partial E_k}{\partial \Delta}$$

Here we use $E_k = \sqrt{\xi_k^2 + \Delta^2}$ so that

$$\frac{\partial E_k}{\partial \Delta} = -\frac{\Delta}{\sqrt{\xi_k^2 + \Delta^2}} = \frac{\Delta}{E_k}$$

Further, we note that $u_k v_k = \frac{1}{2} \sqrt{1 - \frac{\xi_k^2}{E_k^2}} = \frac{1}{2} \frac{\Delta}{E_k}$. Then

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial \Omega}{\partial \Delta} &= 0 \\ -2 \sum_{\mathbf{k}} u_k v_k + 2 \frac{L^3}{g} \Delta + 2 \sum_{\mathbf{k}} \frac{\Delta/E_k}{1 + e^{E_k/k_B T}} &= 0 \\ -2 \sum_{\mathbf{k}} u_k v_k \left[1 - 2 \frac{1}{1 + e^{E_k/k_B T}} \right] + 2 \frac{L^3}{g} \Delta &= 0 \end{aligned}$$

But this just equals the gap equation (158):

$$\Delta = \frac{g}{L^3} \sum_{\mathbf{k}} u_k v_k \left[1 - 2 \frac{1}{e^{E_k/k_B T} + 1} \right]$$

Done.